

3.8 Fiscal Analysis

3.8.1 Existing Conditions

2008 Property Tax Revenues

The project site consists of four tax parcels as follows:

- Town of Haverstraw - 25.18-2-3 and 25.18-2-4
- Town of Ramapo - 33.06-1-1 and 33.06-1-2

The project site has a combined current assessed valuation of \$3,249,400. The assessed value of the project site is based on its present status as a primarily vacant parcel with one parcel being used as an automotive repair garage. Tax lot numbers and current assessed values of the parcels are summarized in Table 3.8-1.

Table 3.8-1 Tax Lots and 2005 Assessed Value		
	Tax Lot	Assessed Value
Town of Haverstraw	25.18-2-3	\$1,299,000
	25.18-2-4	\$1,229,600
	Subtotal	\$2,528,600
Town of Ramapo	33.06-1-1	\$575,000
	33.06-1-2	\$145,800
	Subtotal	\$720,800
Total Assessed Value		\$3,249,400
<i>Source: Town of Haverstraw Tax Receiver. Town of Ramapo Tax Receiver.</i>		

Table 3.8-2 below provides a summary of the taxes paid by the subject property in 2008 for the Town of Haverstraw and Table 3.8-3 provides a summary of the taxes paid in 2008 for the Town of Ramapo. Current annual property taxes are approximately \$59,028 in the Town of Haverstraw and \$118,656 in the Town of Ramapo according to 2008 tax bills (for the East Ramapo Central School District, the bill is for the 2008-2009 school year).

Table 3.8-2 2008 Property Tax Revenues, Town of Haverstraw				
Taxing Jurisdiction	Rate (per \$1,000 or per unit)	Taxes on Parcel 25.18-2-3	Taxes on Parcel 25.18-2-4	Property Tax Revenues
Rockland County	1.293	\$1,679.61	\$1,589.87	\$3,269.48
Town General Fund	6.788	\$8,817.61	\$8,346.52	\$17,164.13
Part Town	0.51	\$662.49	\$627.10	\$1,289.59
Highway	0.815	\$1,058.69	\$1,002.12	\$2,060.81
Transfer station	0.75	0.00	0.00	0.00
Moleston Fire District	0.801	\$1,040.50	\$984.91	\$2,025.41
Lighting 1	0.069	\$89.63	\$84.84	\$174.47
Sewer 2	0.025	\$32.63	\$30.74	\$63.22
Water District	0.143	\$185.76	\$175.83	\$361.59
Haverstraw Ambulance	0.317	\$411.78	\$389.78	\$801.56
Solid Waste	-	\$197.60	161.96	\$359.56
East Ramapo Central Schools	11.8783	\$15,429.91	\$14,605.56	\$30,035.47
Finkelstein Library	0.562656	\$730.89	\$691.84	\$1,422.73
TOTAL				\$59,028.02

Source: Town of Ramapo, Tax Receiver's Office

Table 3.8-3 2008 Property Tax Revenues, Town of Ramapo				
Taxing Jurisdiction	Tax Rate per 1,000 or per unit	Taxes on Parcel 33.6-1-1	Taxes on Parcel 33.6-1-2	Property Tax Revenues
Rockland County	10.000000	\$5,750.00	\$1,458.00	\$7,208.00
Town Police	19.822600	\$11,398.00	\$2,890.14	\$14,288.13
General Town	8.936101	\$5,138.26	\$1,302.88	\$6,441.14
Unincorporated Town	4.942001	\$2,841.65	\$720.54	\$3,562.19
Ambulance Dist #1	1.753001	\$1,007.98	\$255.59	\$1,463.56
Moleston Fire District	3.675401	\$2,113.36	\$535.87	\$2,649.23
Ramapo Lighting District	0.698001	\$401.35	\$101.77	\$503.12
Sewer District RR	4.649301	\$2,673.35	\$677.87	\$3,351.22
Sewer District RR*	267.172700		\$801.52	\$801.52
Solid Waste District	1.056420	\$607.44	\$154.03	\$761.47
Compost*	13.200000		\$48.60	\$48.60
Water NR #1	1.206800	\$699.66	\$177.41	\$877.07
East Ramapo Central	89.392920	\$58,570.82	\$14,851.52	\$73,422.34
Finkelstein Library	4.360000	\$2,774.43	\$703.50	\$3,477.93
TOTAL		\$93,976.30	\$24,630.64	\$118,656.00

** Tax calculated per 3 units
Source: Town of Ramapo, Tax Receiver's Office; Tim Miller Associates, Inc.*

Rockland County received \$10,477.48 in property tax revenues generated by the Minisceongo Park site in 2008. The site generated \$24,300 for the jurisdictions in the Town of Haverstraw and \$30,634 in the Town of Ramapo. The entire site is located in the East Ramapo Central School District. Annual property tax revenues that accrue to the East Ramapo Central School District totaled approximately \$103,457 for the 2008-2009 school year. The East Ramapo Central School District collects taxes for the libraries within the district. The library taxes generated by the project site totaled \$4,900 for 2008.

3.8.2 Potential Impacts

Projected Costs

According to Melissa B. Reimer, the Deputy Directory of Finance for the Town of Ramapo, in 2008 the municipal budget for the Town amounted to \$68,570,580 and the estimated service area population for the Town was approximately 113,764. Dividing the overall budget by the estimated population ($\$68,570,580/113,764$) provides an estimate of per capita municipal costs of \$602. Approximately 70 percent of this amount, or \$47,678,359, would be raised by the property tax, or approximately \$419 per capita.

Minisceongo Park is projected to increase the population of the Town of Ramapo by 412 persons, including 58 school aged children. Since the current annual per capita property tax levy for municipal services in the Town of Ramapo is estimated at \$419, the additional 412 persons projected for the Minisceongo residential development would induce approximately \$172,628 in additional costs payable through the property tax.

Costs for proposed shopping center in the Town of Haverstraw were projected using the Proportional Valuation Fiscal Impact Method described by Robert Burchell and David Listokin.¹ This method assigns costs attributable to the share of the real property value that a nonresidential use adds to a community's real tax base. A share of total municipal costs is given to all local nonresidential uses, and then a portion of these costs is allocated to the incoming nonresidential facility. The cost analysis was based on the Town of Haverstraw 2008 municipal budget of \$30,014,280 and a market value of \$4,318,000 for the proposed 254,000 square foot development in the Town of Haverstraw. The projected additional costs to the Town of Haverstraw from the proposed development would total \$28,505.

Projected Tax Revenues

The Minisceongo Park development would result in the conversion of vacant land and an automotive repair garage to a mixed use residential and commercial development. The increased market value of the project site, with these improvements, would result in an increase in property tax revenues.

To analyze fiscal impacts, projected annual property tax revenues were calculated by estimating the future assessed value of the new development applicable to each taxing jurisdiction and multiplying the result by the tax rate applicable to each. Consistent with fiscal impact methodology described in *The Fiscal Impact Handbook*,² the property tax revenues have been determined by considering what would be generated if the development were completed and occupied today. This approach recognizes that development often requires several years to be completed and that inflation will increase costs and revenues over time. It assumes that the rising costs of public services will be matched by an essentially comparable increase in revenues through increases in the tax rate, all other things being held constant.

¹ The Fiscal Impact Handbook The Center for Urban Policy Research, 1978.

² Burchell and Listokin.

Table 3.8-4 shows the projected and assessed values of each component of the project. The projected assessed values are based on the Uniform Percent of Value of 108.48 in Haverstraw and 12.38 in Ramapo.

Table 3.8-4			
2008 Assessed and Market Values of Minisceongo Park			
	Development Type	Projected Market Value	Projected Assessed Value*
Town of Ramapo	2 bedroom Multifamily	\$76,431,000	\$9,668,521
	Commercial C	\$2,250,000	\$28,460
	Commercial D	\$815,676	\$103,183
	Commercial E	\$502,500	\$63,566
	Commercial F	\$1,200,000	\$151,800
	Ramapo (subtotal)	\$79,174,176	\$10,015,533
Town of Haverstraw	Commercial A	\$1,740,000	\$1,887,552
	Commercial B	\$12,992,000	\$14,093,722
	Haverstraw (subtotal)	\$14,732,000	\$15,931,274
Project Total		\$93,906,176	\$25,996,807
<p>* Project Assessed Value in the Town of Ramapo based on a Uniform % of Value of 12.38. Project Assessed Value in the Town of Haverstraw based on a Uniform % of Value of 108.48. Table prepared by Tim Miller Associates, Inc., 2008.</p>			

The tax revenues to be generated by the residential portion of Minisceongo Park were determined using an average sales price (market value) of \$349,000 per multifamily unit. The market value of the commercial buildings A and B to be located in the Town of Haverstraw were estimated to be \$1,740,000 and \$12,992,000 respectively, based on a market value of \$58.00 per square foot. The market value of the commercial pads C, E, and F, proposed for restaurant uses in the Town of Ramapo were estimated to be \$2,250,000, \$502,500, and \$1,200,000, respectively, based on a per square foot market value of \$150. Commercial pad D proposed for bank use was estimated to have a market value of \$815,676, based on a per square foot market value of \$204. The market value of the project as a whole is estimated to be \$93,906,176.

The assessed value of the project was calculated by multiplying the market value within each municipality by the equalization rate applicable to the municipality. The equalization rate is 108.48 percent in the Town of Haverstraw and 12.65 percent in the Town of Ramapo and the. Table 3.8-4 summarizes the assessed value of the proposed development. The assessed value of the Haverstraw portion of the Minisceongo Park development is \$15,931,274, and the assessed value of the Ramapo portion is \$10,015,533.

Town of Haverstraw

Table 3.8-5 projects the annual property tax that would be generated by the two commercial buildings proposed to be built in the Town of Haverstraw. The Town of Haverstraw General Fund, which includes the taxes for the Haverstraw Police Department among other services, would receive \$108,481 annually in tax revenues. The Haverstraw Highway Department is anticipated to receive an estimated \$13,025 in taxes from the proposed development. The property would generate \$8,150 to the "part town" budget.

Projected tax revenues to be paid to the Water District would total \$2,285 annually. The property after development would pay taxes to Sewer District #1. Based on a unit charge of \$158 the property would be anticipated to generate \$20,066 in taxes to the Sewer District based on the rate of 127 units, obtained by the method of calculation set forth in Section 137-3, Schedule of units of use, in the Town Code.

Table 3.8-5 Projected Tax Revenues - Minisceongo Park Town of Haverstraw		
	Rate (per \$1,000)*	Property Tax Revenues
Taxing Jurisdiction		
Rockland County	1.293000	\$20,664
Town General Tax	6.788000	\$108,481
Part Town	.510000	\$8,150
Highway	.815000	\$13,025
Moleston Fire	.801000	\$12,801
Lighting	89.6300	\$1,103
Sewer #1 **	127	\$20,066
Water District	.143000	\$2,285
Haverstraw Ambulance	.317000	\$5,066
Solid Waste Disposal	.13172	\$2,105
East Ramapo Central School District	11.878300	\$189,830
Library	.562656	\$8,992
TOTAL		\$392,568
Source: Town of Haverstraw, Tax Receiver's Office; Tim Miller Associates, Inc.		
* Assessed Values rounded to the nearest dollar.		
** Unit value = \$158		

Town of Ramapo

Table 3.8-6 below shows the estimates for annual property tax revenues that would be generated by the 219 multifamily units and four commercial pads in the Town of Ramapo.

Table 3.8-6 Projected Tax Revenues - Minisceongo Park Town of Ramapo		
	Taxes Generated	
	Rate (per \$1,000 AV*)	Total Property Tax Revenues
Taxing Jurisdiction		
Rockland County	10.00000	\$100,155
Town Police	19.822600	\$198,534
General Town	8.936101	\$89,500
Unincorporated Town	4.942001	\$49,497
Ambulance Dist #1	1.753001	\$17,557
Moleston Fire District	3.675401	\$36,811
Ramapo Lighting District	0.698001	\$6,991
Sewer District RR	4.649301	\$46,565
Sewer District RR**	267.172700	0
Solid Waste District	1.056420	\$10,581
Compost**	16.20000	0
Water NR #1	1.216800	\$12,187
East Ramapo Central Schools	101.862289	\$1,020,206
Finkelstein Library	4.8525092	\$48,326
TOTAL		\$1,636,910
Source: Town of Ramapo, Tax Receiver's Office; Tim Miller Associates, Inc.		
* - Assessed Value. Values rounded to the nearest dollar.		
** Calculated on a per unit basis		

Jurisdictions with the Town of Ramapo would receive property tax revenues of \$568,378 annually that would accrue to the Town General Fund, Part Town, and the Ramapo Police Department, utilities and other special districts. The various utility districts and service providers would receive tax revenues to pay for solid waste, sewer, and water services provided to the development. The Town of Ramapo charges sewer and compost disposal fees on a per unit basis. As informed by the Tax Receiver's Office of the Town of Ramapo, the unit charge is based on the number of employees on the commercial development of the property or the number of residences in the residential portion of the development. Once the number of residents and employees is determined, the Town of Ramapo would receive additional fees for sewer and water service.

Rockland County

Rockland County would receive \$120,819 annually in property tax revenues from the project. Additional revenues would accrue to the County Sewer District #1.

East Ramapo Central School District

Minisceongo Park would generate annual property tax revenues of \$1,210,036 to the East Ramapo Central School District. Costs associated with the school district are based on school district data summarized in Section 3.7 of this SEIS.

The 2008-2009 school year budget for the East Ramapo Central School District is \$192,728,148. Of this 128,401,288 was raised by the tax levy (This does not include library taxes.). The total student enrollment for 2008-2009 is 7,966 students. Therefore, the per student cost for 2008-2009 is \$16,119.

The total number of schoolage children to be generated by the project was calculated based on student multiplier data available from the Rutgers University Center for Urban Policy Research Residential Multipliers.³ Based on the proposal for 219 two-bedroom units, a total of 58 school-age children are projected to reside within the Minisceongo Park development, based on the multiplier of 0.14. Based on the per student cost of \$16,119 calculated above, the proposed residential project would be projected to generate \$934,902 in costs to the East Ramapo Central School District.

Given the projected \$934,902 in costs and \$1,210,036 in projected property tax revenues that would be paid to the District, an annual surplus to the District of \$275,134 would be anticipated.

Minisceongo Park would also generate \$8,992 annually in revenues to the Haverstraw King's Daughters Library and \$48,326 to the Finkelstein Memorial Library.

Other Special Districts

The total annual tax revenues to the Moleston Fire District would be \$49,612. The Haverstraw Ambulance Corps would receive approximately \$5,066 and the Spring Hill Community Ambulance Corps in Ramapo would receive approximately 17,557 annually in project-generated tax revenues.

3.8.3 Mitigation Measures

As the proposed project is not anticipated to have a significant impact on any service provider, no mitigation measures are proposed.

³ Robert W. Burchell, David Listokin, William Dolphin. June 2006.