

**3.5 Demographic & Fiscal Resources****3.5.1 Introduction**

The proposed project is a mixed-use development situated on the east side of Red Schoolhouse Road in the Village of Chestnut Ridge, Rockland County New York. The project will include retail, apartments, multifamily duplex townhouses and multifamily senior rental apartments.

The project site consists of 6 parcels of which 3 are currently vacant. The buildings, driveways and auto storage and warehouse facilities on the remaining parcels will be demolished.

The lands to the east of Red Schoolhouse Road are predominantly zoned Laboratory Office (LO). The easternmost portions of the site are residentially zoned R-35.

Equestrian Estates seeks an amendment to the Zoning Code of the Village of Chestnut Ridge to create a zone which allows multifamily and mixed-use development known as Planned Unit Development (PUD). They also seek an amendment to the Zoning Map accommodate the proposed project.

As shown on the Overall Site Development Plan, the layout has been developed to a level of detail which allows consideration of the impacts of the proposed zone amendment. As the Site Development Plan shows, the Applicant proposes to construct 62 high quality residential semi-attached townhouse units; 84 rental apartments, located above up to 38,000 square foot of retail/commercial ground floor space; plus 118 units of senior rental housing. In addition, the community includes a 7,500 square foot stand-alone commercial pad.

The 62 duplex townhouse units will be market rate units for sale available to the general public, the units have an open layout and upscale finishing elements. These units contain 4 bedrooms plus a den area and are likely to sell for \$550,000 to \$600,000 depending upon market conditions at the time of sale.

The 84 apartments located above the retail commercial development along Red Schoolhouse Road will be 2-bedroom units for rent. These units expand the diversity of housing options provided in the Village and will accommodate the needs of millennials and others who wish to live in other than single family detached housing.

The Senior residential buildings will contain rental apartments for persons over 55 years of age. As currently designed the development includes 118 two-bedroom units. Monitoring of the age restriction will be the responsibility of the Rental Management Agency.

Approximately 38,000 square foot of first floor retail space will be provided in the mixed-use building along the Red Schoolhouse Road frontage. An additional 7,500 square foot of commercial space is provided on a stand-alone pad in proximity to the mixed-use buildings.

### 3.5.2 Demographic Resources

#### Existing Demographics

As illustrated in Table 3.5-1 below, the Village of Chestnut Ridge population has remained relatively constant between 2010 and 2021. Without the proposed Equestrian Estates, the population is projected to grow modestly by approximately half a percent by the year 2026. The number of households is also projected to rise modestly, absent the proposed project. The median age has shown a steady increase, consistent with the aging in place taking place throughout the region.

Table 3.5-1 Village of Chestnut Ridge Demographic Analysis			
Year	2010	2021	2026
Total Population	7,916	7,918	7,956
Median Age	44.6	45.6	45.7
Number of Households	2,676	2,720	2,744
Average Household Size	2.89	2.85	2.84
Rate of Growth	--	2010-2021 0.03%	2021-2026 0.48%
Total Housing Units	2,676	2,720	2,744
Owner Occupied Housing Units	2,182	2,215	2,261
Renter Occupied Housing Units	494	505	483
% Renter Occupied	18.5%	18.6%	17.6%
Median Home Value	\$459,200	\$459,320	\$506,379
Average Home Value	\$523,015	\$523,152	\$582,465
Median Household Income	\$98,226	\$102,279	\$110,808
Average Household Income	\$114,496	\$140,674	\$157,874
Source US Census; ESRI Population Projections, 2021			

#### Population Projection

Demographic multipliers published by the Rutgers University Center for Urban Policy Research (CUPR) were used to project the future population of the Equestrian Estates Mixed Use project. As shown in Table 1, Demographic multipliers of 2.83 persons were used to project the population for the 3-BR single family duplex units. Demographic multipliers of 2.31 persons were used to project the population for the 2-BR apartments and includes 0.23 school age children (SAC) per unit. Based upon the age restricted nature of the senior rental apartments, a multiplier of 1.8 persons per two-bedroom unit has been used to project the senior population.

<b>Table 3.5-2 Population Projections</b>					
<b>Unit Type</b>	<b>Number of Units</b>	<b>Population Multiplier</b>	<b>Population</b>	<b>School Age Children Multiplier</b>	<b>School Age Population</b>
<b>Market Rate Single Family Duplex Townhouses</b>					
4 Bedroom	62	3.83	237	1.19	74
<b>Rental Apartments</b>					
2 Bedroom	84	2.31	194	0.23	19
<b>Senior Apartments</b>					
2 Bedroom	118	2.08	212	0	0
<b>Single Family Houses</b>					
4 Bedroom	2	3.67	7	1.05	2
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>266</b>		<b>651</b>		<b>95</b>
Source: Rutgers University Center for Urban Policy Research, June 2006.					

Based upon the residential multipliers, approximately 651 persons are projected to reside in the proposed housing including approximately 95 school age children. This represents just over an 8% growth in the Village's population.

It is anticipated that a number of the new residents may be existing Village residents who move to the proposed development, in which case the housing vacated by those persons moving would be reoccupied by new residents in a manner similar to the normal turnover of housing stock in a community.

### 3.5.3 Fiscal Resources

#### *Current and Projected Assessed Value*

The Equestrian Estate development site is contained on the following Village tax parcels:

- 69.08-2-9
- 69.08-2-10
- 69.08-2-11
- 69.08-2-12
- 69.08-2-22
- 69.13-1-6

The current assessed value of the total project site is \$681,300. According to a review of the 2021 tax bills for the subject parcel, (Refer to Appendix F), the total annual property taxes generated by the project site and paid to the Village of Chestnut Ridge are \$8,214. The municipal taxes paid to the Town of Ramapo are \$44,878. The municipal taxes paid to Rockland County are \$18,436. Thus, the total municipal taxes paid are \$71,527 while the annual property taxes paid to the East Ramapo Central School District are \$84,938.

Based upon the income value of the duplex townhouse units the townhouse portion of the project, known as Club Estates is valued at \$34,456,500. Based upon the income value of the mixed-use

project as described above, the total value of the mixed-use rental apartments is estimated to be \$21,396,375. As described, the mixed-use building is envisioned to include 38,000 square foot of retail space, plus a 7,500 square foot stand-alone pad. Based upon the income value of these commercial components, the value of the commercial component is estimated to be \$5,187,000. The senior housing component is valued at \$21,859,500. The two single family homes on are estimated to have a combined market value of \$1,300,000. Thus, the combined market value of the proposed project is \$84,199,375. Using the current 2021 equalization rate of 11.44 percent, the total Assessed Value of the project used for this analysis is \$9,632,409.

*Current and Projected Revenues*

Table 2 compares the revenues generated currently by the property to the revenues to be generated after the Equestrian Estates mixed-use development is complete. Revenues are based on 2020/2021 tax rates (2020-2021 tax rate for the East Ramapo Central School District).

According to the Village of Chestnut Ridge annual budget, the Village's tax rate includes Village governmental services, Village Justice Court, refuse collection, street maintenance, public parking, lighting and parks & recreation.

As presented in Table 3.5-3, at today 's tax rates annual revenues to the Village of Chestnut Ridge would be approximately \$116,129. Revenues to the Town of Ramapo would total \$966,516. The project-generated annual revenues to Rockland County would be approximately \$260,653 annually.

<b>Table 3.5-3 Current &amp; Projected Taxes Generated by Equestrian Estates Development</b>			
<b>Taxing Authority</b>	<b>Current Taxes (\$)</b>	<b>Equestrian Estates Projected Taxes Total (\$)</b>	<b>Net Increase Between Current &amp; Projected Taxes (\$)</b>
<b>Total Rockland County</b>	<b>\$18,436</b>	<b>\$260,653</b>	<b>\$242,217</b>
<b>Total Town of Ramapo</b>	<b>\$44,878</b>	<b>\$966,516</b>	<b>\$921,638</b>
<b>Total Village of Chestnut Ridge</b>	<b>\$8,214</b>	<b>\$116,129</b>	<b>\$107,915</b>
<b>Total Municipal</b>	<b>\$71,527</b>	<b>\$1,343,298</b>	<b>\$1,271,771</b>
<b>East Ramapo Central School District</b>	<b>\$84,938</b>	<b>\$1,200,872</b>	<b>\$1,115,935</b>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$156,465</b>	<b>\$2,544,170</b>	<b>\$2,387,705</b>

Notes: <sup>(1)</sup> Tax Rate per \$1,000 of Assessed Valuation.  
Municipal taxes are based upon Village of Chestnut Ridge 2020/2021 Tax Rates.  
East Ramapo Central School Tax Rates are for the 2020-2021 school year.

Annual revenues to the East Ramapo Central School District would be approximately \$1,200,872. The net *increase* between the current tax revenues generated by the site and paid to the School District and the total future project-generated revenues to the school district are projected to be approximately \$1,115,935.

Table 3.5-2 also indicates the net increase in revenues to each jurisdiction, which in total is projected to be almost \$2.4 million annually.

*Municipal Costs Associated with the Proposed Project*

An approximate estimate of costs to the Village of Chestnut Ridge associated with the proposed mixed-use development may be determined by obtaining a reasonable composite of current costs on a per capita basis and multiplying this amount by the anticipated population of the proposed project.

Through a review of the Village's operating budget, the amount of expenditures can be derived and, by dividing the population into the amount of expenditures, an estimate of per capita costs can be determined. To calculate the portion of the per capita cost which is paid for by property tax revenues (as opposed to other forms of income to the Village), the per capita cost is multiplied by the proportion that property tax revenue comprises of the overall income stream.

This generalized methodology estimates the overall costs. The incremental costs which would be applicable specifically to this project are anticipated to be substantially lower, particularly to the Village. Certain fixed costs would not actually be affected by an increase in population. For example, the Mayor's salary or the cost of running Village Hall are expenses that are paid by the Village Budget, but would not be expected to increase based on an increase in population. It is also noted that commercial and other land uses in the Village place demand on the various Village and other governmental services which contributes to the per capita costs being overstated. The majority of services provided by the Village would not be directly affected by an increase in population. Based upon the nature of services provided by the Village of Chestnut Ridge, impact of per capita costs is estimated to be 25% of the total per capita calculation.

In this instance, the adopted 2020-2021 municipal budget for the Village of Chestnut Ridge amounts to \$3,613,790. The total amount to be raised by taxes is \$1,902,970. The tax levy represents 52.7 percent of the total municipal budget.

According to the US Census American Community Survey data, the 2019 estimated service area population for the Village is 8,020 persons. Dividing the budget to be raised by taxes by the population, and applying the 25% factor results in an estimated impact to the Village budget of \$37 per capita.

As described earlier, the proposed project would add approximately 651 persons to the population of the Village. Based on a per capita expenditure of \$37, the additional costs to the Village of Chestnut Ridge are projected to be up to approximately \$24,087. As presented in Table 3.5-2, the revenues to the Village from the proposed Equestrian Estates Development would amount to a total of \$116,129, thus, the project will result in a net benefit to the Village of more than \$92,000 annually. The increase in tax revenue to the Village, upon completion of development is projected to be \$107,915 compared to existing tax revenues.

Using similar methodologies, the Tax levy paid to the Town of Ramapo by Village residents for Town wide and Highway services amounts to \$42,650,568. The cost for these services is more directly related to the size of the population. The total municipal per capita cost of these services for Village residents to the Town is estimated to be \$175, thus the additional costs to the Town of Ramapo as a result of the Equestrian Estates development are projected to be approximately \$113,925. As presented in Table 3.5-2, the revenues to the Town from the proposed project

would amount to a total of \$966,516 resulting in a net benefit **after** covering costs, of more than \$850,000 annually.

*School District Costs Associated with the Proposed Project*

As shown in Table 3.5-2, based upon demographic multipliers published by the Rutgers University Center for Urban Policy Research, approximately 95 students are projected to reside in the proposed residential development. Almost all these students are projected to live in the duplex townhouse units.

The budget for the 2019-2020 school year for the East Ramapo Central School District totals approximately \$241,185,222. The portion of the budget to be raised through taxation is \$154,490,227 - approximately 54 percent of the budget is met through the property tax levy. The addition of 95 students to a population of approximately 9,000 students represents an increase of approximately one percent. This increase in student population will not have a significant impact on administrative or capital needs of the district. Any costs to the District's would be related specifically to programming costs, which are referred to as marginal costs, District wide, these costs total \$159,283,757. Since 54 percent of the Budget is to be raised by the tax levy, the portion of these costs to be raised by the tax levy total \$86,099,656.

With an enrollment of 8,900 students, the per-student marginal cost to be raised by the tax levy are calculated to be \$9,674, ( $\$86,099,656 / 8,900$ ). This cost is likely overstated given the small percentage of new students compared to the existing student population. Projected costs to the school district could be up to \$919,030 annually based on an estimated 95 students that would reside in the community.

At today's tax rates, the proposed Equestrian Estates would generate a total of \$1,200,872 in annual property revenues to the school district. Thus, the overall impact on the district's budget is expected to be positive. The proposed mixed-use project will generate \$1,115,935 above current taxes. The anticipated tax revenue will result in a substantial net benefit to tax payers of more than \$280,000 annually to the East Ramapo Central School District based partially on the fact that no school age children will be living in the senior residential development in combination with the tax benefit of increased commercial development.

Table 3.5-4 presents a summary of the conservatively anticipated revenues compared to an estimate of costs of the proposed Equestrian Estates development project. The combined net positive revenues, after considering the generalized costs to the Village, Town and the School District is an annual amount of \$1,226,312 to all taxing jurisdictions.

<b>Table 3.5-4 Revenue &amp; Cost Summary: Equestrian Estates Mixed Use Development</b>			
<b>Jurisdiction</b>	<b>Projected Taxes (\$)</b>	<b>Projected Costs (\$)</b>	<b>Net Tax Revenue</b>
<i>Village of Chestnut Ridge</i>	\$116,129	(\$24,087)	\$92,042
<i>Town of Ramapo</i>	\$966,516	(\$113,925)	\$852,591
<i>East Ramapo Central Schools</i>	\$1,200,872	(\$919,030)	\$281,842
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,283,517</b>	<b>(\$1,057,205)</b>	<b>\$1,226,312</b>

Source: Tim Miller Associates, Inc., 2021

### 3.5.4 Fiscal Benefits

The project will induce construction employment in the short term. In the long-term, the new resident population would introduce consumer demand for the retail and service establishments located within the Village of Chestnut Ridge, as well as the larger commercial area within the region.

#### *Short Term Employment Opportunities*

The construction value of the proposed project would total approximately \$57.1 million. Construction of the project would require a commitment of person hours of labor, which can be viewed as beneficial to the community, the local economy, and the construction industry with respect to the generation of jobs. Based on labor hour estimates published by the Urban Land Institute, and accounting for secondary employment resulting from the construction, this project would generate 300 full time equivalent jobs in the various construction trades associated with this project.

It is anticipated that a number of construction workers would come from Rockland County and nearby counties in the region. These workers are expected to have a positive impact on existing local businesses that provide such services as food convenience shopping, gasoline, etc.

#### *Long Term Employment Opportunities*

The proposed project includes construction of 45,500 square feet of new retail and commercial space thus increasing employment opportunities in the Village of Chestnut Ridge.

There are several multipliers available to estimate the number of employees generated by non-residential development. The Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE) Parking Generation<sup>1</sup> estimates 3.4 jobs per 1,000 square foot of office building space. The ITE Trip Generation Handbook<sup>2</sup> indicates approximately 3.3 employees per 1,000 square foot of Office Space. A multiplier of three jobs per 1,000 square foot has been used for the purpose of this analysis to estimate the number of jobs that could be generated.

<sup>1</sup>ITE Parking Generation (4th Edition 2010. Page 201)

<sup>2</sup>ITE Trip Generation for Land Use 710. General Office Building

Utilizing the 3.0 employees per 1,000 square foot of commercial space, the Equestrian Estates development has the potential to add approximately 136 new jobs to the Village's employment base.

#### *Local Economy Spending*

Future residents would utilize retail, personal service, and other commercial uses located in the project vicinity. Businesses within the project vicinity, especially those located within the Village, would benefit from new resident expenditures. Approximately 30 percent of household income is typically spent on retail goods and services.

A household income ranging from \$70,000 to \$110,000 annually, would be required to afford renting the proposed apartments including seniors and mixed-use. Using an average household income of \$90,000, it is estimated that 202 households (118 plus 84) would spend more than \$5.4 million annually. The 62 single family duplex units would generate an additional \$3 million in expenditures annually. When combined more than \$8 million in sales can be expected. A substantial portion of these expenditures would be made at supermarkets, local convenience stores, apparel stores, restaurants and service businesses such as gas stations and hair salons in the area.

It is anticipated that a number of the Equestrian Estates residents may be existing Village residents who move to Equestrian Estates, in which case the housing vacated by those persons moving would be reoccupied by new residents who would contribute to the increase in spending described above.

#### **3.5.5 Summary**

The proposed Equestrian Estates development will provide a diversity of housing in the Village of Chestnut Ridge, in addition to an increase in new retail opportunities. As a result of this project the community will realize the following economic benefits:

- Collective municipal and school revenues are projected to total approximately \$2,544,170 annually.
- Tax revenue to the School District will increase by approximately \$1,115,935, and result in an annual net benefit to the district *after covering costs* by more than \$280,000.
- The project will result in net benefit revenue to the Village of more than \$92,000 annually.
- The project-generated annual revenues to Rockland County would be approximately \$260,653 annually.
- Retail spending by the new residents of the community is projected to exceed \$8 million annually.

The project would generate about 300 full time equivalent jobs in the various construction trades associated with this project and approximately 136 full time jobs upon completion.